

INDIAN RAILWAYS TECHNICAL SUPERVISORS ASSOCIATION

(Estd. 1965, Regd. No.1329, website <http://www.irtsa.net>)

M. Shanmugam, Central President,
4, Sixth Street, TVS Nagar, Chennai- 600050.
Email-cpirtsa@yahoo.com
Mob: 09443140817
No. IRTSA/ SCPC/ RB



Harchandan Singh, General Secretary, C.Hq.
32, Phase 6, Mohali, Chandigarh-160055.
Email-gsirts@yahoo.com
(Ph:0172-2228306, 931613159)
Dated 29. 10. 2008.

1. Chairman, Railway Board, Rail Bhavan, New Delhi.
2. Member Staff, Railway Board, Rail Bhavan, New Delhi.
3. Member Mechanical, Railway Board, Rail Bhavan, New Delhi.

Respected Sir,

**Subject: - Anomalies of Sixth Pay Commission:
- Regarding Grade Pay of Senior Section Engineers in Indian Railways**

**Reference: - i) Railway Services (Revised Pay) Rules, 2008 (RBE 103/2008) &
Schedule for Revised Scales of Pay (RBE 108/2008)**

ii) Our Memoranda dated 21 / 22. 4. 2008 & 25. 08. 2008 –

REG. PLIGHT OF ENGINEERS / TECHNICAL SUPERVISORS ON RAILWAYS

1. Serious Injustice & Disparity with the Senior Section Engineers (SSE):-

Senior Section Engineers (SSE) on the Railways are victims of major anomaly & disparity in both at the hands of Fifth & Sixth Pay Commissions. Sixth Pay Commissions and the Railways have unjustly placed the Section Engineers & Senior Section Engineers in PB-2 with a Grade Pay of Rs 4600 instead of PB 3 with Grade Pay of Rs 5400 or Rs 4800 granted to those who were in equal or even lower scales to them.

Section Engineers (SEs) (in pre-revised scale Rs 6500-10500) are recruited on the Railways with Engineering Degree as qualifications and one year 'on the job training' or are promoted to that post after long years of service experience as Junior Engineers who are themselves having Engineering Diploma as qualification and one & half years of 'on the job training'.

Section Engineers (in the Pre-revised scale Rs 6500-10500) & Senior Section Engineers (in the Pre-revised scale Rs 7450-11500) are 'Spot' or "Field" Managers - directly managing production, repair & maintenance of Locomotives, Rolling Stock, P-way Tracks, Works, Stores, Signal Telecom, IT / EDP Centers, Chemical & Metallurgical Laboratories and look after the planning, quality control, safety, efficiency and effective execution of administrative polices and targets in the field and on the shop floor, shed or depot, being directly responsible for round the clock management of the system against all odds, constrains, shortages of staff and material resources as well as vagaries of nature. Their duties & responsibilities have increased manifold & become more onerous & demanding due to modernization of the entire Railway system. But all these aspects have been ignored by the Pay Commission.

2. Injustice by Fifth CPC & its impact:-

a) **Non-application of common multiple factor to S-13 only:-** Senior Section Engineers (SSE) on the Railways, were the only ones to have been denied the application the multiple factor of 3.25 by the Fifth CPC which it had applied in respect of all Pay Scales of (except that of SSE). Fifth CPC unjustly proposed a Pay Scale of Rs 7000-11500 as against the pre-revised scale of Rs 2375-3500. After much representation, the Railway Board revised it to Rs 7450-11500.

Non-application of common multiple factor & discrimination by V CPC with S-13 of Senior Section Engineers only, is illustrated in Annexure-1.

Had the common multiple factor of 3.25 been applied to the Scale of Senior Section Engineers (SSE), by the Fifth CPC – as was done in all other cases - it would have worked out to be at least Rs. 7750–250–12750 and the Fifth CPC scale of Senior Section Engineers (SSE)

should have been Rs 8000- 13000 (S-15). Consequently the Grade Pay of Senior Section Engineers (SSE), should be Rs 5400 after Sixth CPC.

b) **Equating the unequals & disturbing vertical relativity**:- Fifth Pay Commission equated the non-technical cadres with technical cadres. It also disturbed the existing relativities – badly ignoring the ground realities that the non-technical staff (like Office Superintendent & Chief Clerks) working under the Section Engineers and Senior Section Engineers, were placed in the same pay scales as those of the later – thereby violating settled principles of law enshrined in the Constitution of India, that **“an equal cannot be over an equal.”**

3) Discrimination by Sixth CPC:

Sixth Pay Commission has not followed any uniform multiplication factor like the Fifth Pay Commission; nor has it considered the job requirements, qualifications or experience and responsibilities. Senior Section Engineers have unjustly been singled out to have not been given any upgrading by SCPC, although almost all other categories have been given some upgrading. This clubbed with the injustice done by the Fifth CPC has resulted in serious anomaly in respect of the Grade Pay of Senior Section Engineers (in the Pre-revised scale Rs 7450-11500).

Disturbance of Horizontal Parity & Vertical Relativities

Third and Fourth Pay Commissions maintained a relativity between Technical & non-technical cadres and allotted the scales of Rs 840-1040 / Rs 840-1200 and Rs 2375-3500 respectively to Technical Supervisors which were the highest amongst all Group “C” employees due to the onerous and critical nature of their duties and responsibilities.

But, while the Fifth pay commission disturbed the vertical relativities and equated the unequal by allotting pay scales equal Senior Section Engineers to the non-technical cadres working under them; the Sixth Pay Commission has disturbed both vertical relativities as well as the horizontal parities. Not only that, the Sixth CPC and the Railways have even granted higher Grade Pays to the Nurses, Matrons, Chief Matrons, Teachers & Section Officers Accounts - who were in lower or equal pay scales to those of the Senior Section Engineers and Junior Engineers.

Assistant Nursing Superintendents (Pre-revised scale Rs 6500-10500), Deputy Nursing Superintends (scale Rs 7500-12000) have all been placed in PB-3. Similarly Teachers and Section Officers / Senior Section Officers Accounts have all been given upgradation and granted Grade Pays of Rs 5400 / Rs 4800 (**as per details in Annexure 2**). As such there is no justification for granting the Grade Pay of only Rs 4600 to Section Engineers / Senior Section Engineers.

No consideration has been given by the Sixth CPC to the onerous nature of Duties and Responsibilities of Engineers / Technical Supervisor - which have increased manifold and become more onerous over the years especially due to modernization on the Railways, indiscriminate shrinking of staff strength and numerous other factors.

Entry qualification for both the Nursing Staff and JEs are 3 Years Diploma in their respective disciplines and both also have to undergo a training of one and a half year followed by examination before absorption. Job requirements of J.Es. S.Es. and SSEs. are equally onerous and demanding to ensure safety and efficiency on the Railways, where one single mistake can endanger not one, but thousand lives.

The disparities have grown manifold over the years. It is high time something is done about all this by the Railways. Particularly the SSE (*Senior Section Engineers*) on the Railways, have been given a very raw deal by the Sixth Pay Commission. Whether it is denial of Group B status to them by the Railways or the inadequate Grade Pay and discrimination vis-à-vis other categories, it is all, most humiliating and a gross injustice.

This is bound to affect their efficiency and may indirectly affect the growth, development and productivity. There is essential need to ameliorate their sufferings and to check the growing frustration amongst them.

4) DISTURBANCE OF VERTICAL RELATIVITY BETWEEN SSE SCALE AND MAXIMUM & MINIMUM WAGES SINCE THIRD PAY COMMISSION.

Scale of SSE has steadily declined with respect to both minimum and maximum of pay scale vis-à-vis Minimum & maximum of wages of Central Government employees including those of the Railways as apparent from the following table.

Ratio of SSE scale to Minimum & Maximum of Wages, from 3rd to 6th Pay Commission

Pay Commission	Minimum Wages	Maximum Wages	SSE scale	Ratio of SSE scale to Minimum Wages	Ratio of SSE scale to Maximum Wages
III CPC	196	4000	840	4.28	0.21
IV CPC	750	9000	2375	3.16	0.26
V CPC	2550	30000	7450	2.92	0.24
VI CPC	7000	90000	18460	2.63	0.20

5. Denial of Group B status to Senior Section Engineers & lack of avenues of promotion: All the previous three Pay Commissions had recommended for classification of the Pay Scales of senior Technical Supervisors to be classified in Group B and the Government had also accepted the recommendations in this regard, except in case of Fifth Pay Commission where in the Government had modified the recommendations (*as per details in Annexure III*). But the Railways did not implement any of the orders issued after any of the 3 Pay Commissions.

In comparison to other departments and all India Average, Railways is having lowest number of gazetted posts (*as per details given in the Annexure 3*). This will hamper and slow down the activities of huge investment besides adversely effecting the efficiency and safety on the Railways.

6. Proposed Pay bands for Technical Supervisors on Railways

(Including Design and Drawing Engineers, CMT staff & DMS / Stores Supervisors)

All the foregoing facts are causing much heart burning to the Technical Supervisors on the Railways due to clear-cut discrimination & denial of law of natural justice.

It is requested that, keeping in view their qualifications, duties, responsibilities and over all job requirements as well as increase thereof over the years due to modernization on the Railways and comparative wages of their counterparts elsewhere-

i) JEs (Junior Engineers) may please be granted Grade Pay of Rs 4600;

ii) Section Engineers / Senior Section Engineers be granted the grade Pay of Rs 5400

Designation	Pay Band	Corresponding Pay bands	Grade pay
Junior Engineer-II	PB-2	9300-34800	4600
Junior Engineer-I			
Section Engineer	PB-3	15600-39100	5400
Sr. Section Engineer			

iii) Posts of Senior Section Engineers may please be classified in Group B Gazetted.

Thanking You Sir,

Yours faithfully,

**NON-APPLICATION OF COMMON MULTIPLICATION FACTOR OF 3.25
ONLY FOR SSE (S-13) SCALE BY FIFTH PAY COMMISSION**

Scale	IV CPC scale	V CPC scale	Multiplication factor
S-1	750-940	2550-3200	3.4
S-2	775-1025	2610-3540	3.37
S-3	800-1150	2650-4000	3.31
S-4	825-1200	2750-4400	3.33
S-5	950-1400	3050-4590	3.21
S-6	975-1540	3200-4900	3.28
S-7	1200-1800	4000-6000	3.33
S-8	1350-2200	4500-7000	3.33
S-9	1400-2600	5000-8000	3.57
S-10	1640-2900	5500-9000	3.35
S-11	2000-3200	6500-10500	3.25
S-12	2000-3500	6500-10500	3.25
<u>S-13</u>	<u>2375-3750</u>	<u>7000-11500</u> <u>7450-11500</u>	<u>2.94</u> <u>3.14</u>
S-14	2200-4000	7500-12000	3.41
S-15	2200-4000	8000-13500	3.64
S-16	3630 Fixed	9000 Fixed	2.48
S-17	2630-2780	9000-9550	3.42
S-18	3150-3350	10325-10975	3.28
S-19	3000-4500	10000-15200	3.33
S-20	3200-4700	10650-15850	3.33
S-21	3700-5000	12000-16500	3.24
S-22	3950-5000	12750-16500	3.23
S-23	3700-5700	12000-18000	3.24
S-24	4100-5300	14300-18300	3.49
S-25	4800-5700	15100-18300	3.15
S-26	5100-6300	16400-20000	3.22
S-27	5100-6700	16400-20900	3.22
S-28	4500-7300	14300-22400	3.17
S-29	5900-6700	18400-22400	3.12
S-30	7300-7600	22400-24500	3.07
S-31	7300-8000	22400-26000	3.07
S-32	7600-8000	24050-26000	3.16
S-33	8000 Fixed	26000 Fixed	3.25
S-34	9000	30000 Fixed	3.33

Annexure-2

Posts in Railways Upgraded to the scales above Technical Supervisors by SCPC
(which were previously at par OR even lower scales than Technical Supervisors)

(Ref: Railway Board No.PC-VI/2008/II/RSRP/1. RBE No.124/2008, Dated 22.09.2008)

Post	Pre revised scale	Pay band	Corresponding pay bands	Grade pay
Nursing Staff				
Chief Matron	7450-11500 6500-10500	PB-3	15600-39100	5400
Nursing Sister	5500-9000	PB-2	9300-34800	4800
Staff Nurse	5000-8000	PB-2	9300-34800	4600
Primary school teachers				
Selection Grade	6500-10500	PB-2	9300-34800	4800
Senior Grade	5500-9000	PB-2	9300-34800	4600
Basic Grade	4500-7000	PB-2	9300-34800	4200
Trained Graduate Teachers				
Selection Grade	7500-12000	PB-2	9300-34800	5400
Senior Grade	6500-10500	PB-2	9300-34800	4800
Basic Grade	5500-9000	PB-2	9300-34800	4600
Post Graduate Teachers				
Selection Grade	8000-13500	PB-3	15600-39100	6600
Senior Grade	7500-12000	PB-3	15600-39100	5400
Basic Grade	6500-10500	PB-2	9300-34800	4800
Accounts Department				
Sr. Section Officer	7450-11500	PB-2	9300-34800	4800
Section Officer	6500-10500			
Sr.TIA	7450-11500	PB-2	9300-34800	4800
TIA	6500-10500			
Sr.ISA	7450-11500	PB-2	9300-34800	4800
ISA	6500-10500			
Technical Supervisors				
Junior Engineer II	5000-8000	PB-2	9300-34800	4200
Junior Engineer I	5500-9000			
Section Engineer	6500-10500	PB-2	9300-34800	4600
Sr. Section Engineer	7450-11500			

**LEAST NUMBER OF GAZETTED POSTS ON RAILWAYS
IN COMPARISON TO OTHER DEPARTMENTS.**

S.N	Ministry / Department	%Group A	% Group B	% Group C	% Group D
1	Ministry of Agriculture	6.0	7.5	39.1	47.4
2	Ministry of Chemical and Fertilizers	18.2	30.8	29.8	21.2
3	Ministry of Civil Aviation	11.7	11.0	43.4	33.8
4	Ministry of Coal	10.5	19.7	45.6	24.2
5	Ministry of commerce and Industry	11.8	17.8	47.9	22.6
6	Ministry of Communication and Information Technology	1.7	3.7	76.9	17.7
7	Ministry of Consumer Affairs Food and Public Distribution	17.1	28.8	32.2	21.9
8	Ministry of Corporate Affairs	33.3	34.4	21.1	11.2
9	Ministry of Culture	1.2	2.9	60.7	35.3
10	Ministry of Defence	2.7	5.5	49.8	41.9
11	Ministry of Development of North Eastern Region	18.9	10.1	42.0	29.0
12	Ministry of Earth Sciences	6.2	30.1	38.7	25.0
13	Ministry of Environment and Forest	12.8	8.1	53.7	25.4
14	Ministry of External Affairs	16.4	32.3	35.1	16.2
15	Ministry of Finance	9.1	38.6	32.9	19.4
16	Ministry of Food Processing Industries	31.2	26.4	26.4	15.9
17	Ministry of Health and Family Welfare	11.6	7.6	41.8	39.0
18	Ministry of Industry & Public Enterprises	17.4	30.0	29.4	23.2
19	Ministry of Home Affairs	2.0	3.0	87.4	7.6
20	Ministry of Human Resource Development	15.3	33.2	31.2	20.3
21	Ministry of Information Broad casting	6.4	20.0	48.3	25.4
22	Ministry of Labour and Employment	14.4	18.7	47.1	19.8
23	Ministry of Law and Justice	13.7	28.8	33.5	24.0
24	Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises	12.7	18.1	46.1	23.1
25	Ministry of Mines	18.5	54.9	4.4	22.2
26	Ministry of Minority Affairs	34.4	34.4	18.8	12.5
27	Ministry of New and Renewable Energy	24.6	20.6	35.2	19.6

28	Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs	20.6	33.3	32.4	13.7
29	Ministry of Panchayati Raj	21.2	25.9	37.6	15.3
30	Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs	9.3	31.8	38.8	20.2
31	Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension	11.9	12.4	64.3	11.5
32	Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas	14.5	38.2	25.3	22.0
33	Ministry of Planning	26.2	25.6	23.3	25.0
34	Ministry of Power	29.2	28.0	28.2	14.5
35	Ministry of Railways	0.6	0.5	61.9	37.0
36	Ministry of Rural Development	16.7	36.3	29.4	17.6
37	Ministry of Science and Technology	4.8	7.6	48.3	39.3
38	Ministry of Shipping, Road Transport and Highways	11.3	15.1	45.5	28.1
39	Ministry of Social Justice & Empowerment	15.8	36.8	30.0	17.4
40	Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation	7.3	24.3	56.4	12.0
41	Ministry of Steel	16.8	41.6	29.2	12.4
42	Ministry of Textiles	4.3	10.0	63.8	21.8
43	Ministry of Tribal Affairs	26.2	38.9	23.0	11.9
44	Ministry of Urban Development	4.5	13.0	59.3	23.2
45	Ministry of Water Resources	11.9	16.1	45.9	26.1
46	Ministry of Women & Child Development	11.5	20.3	42.4	25.9
47	Ministry of Youth Affairs and Sports	9.3	27.1	44.7	18.9
48	Department of Atomic Energy	26.2	23.8	36.3	13.6
49	Department of Space	47.5	20.5	25.9	6.1
50	Cabinet Secretariat	9.2	26.5	56.5	7.8
51	Central Vigilance Commission	16.5	32.3	25.6	25.6
	Total	2.8	5.3	64.2	27.6

(Ref: Sixth Central Pay Commission Report)

If all India average of 2.8% in Group – A and 5.3 % in Group – B is followed in Indian Railways then the group wise distribution of IR can be restructured as follows.

Category	Existing proportion	Proposed proportion equal to all India Average	Difference
Group – A	8285	39498	31213
Group – B	7247	74764	67517
Group – C	873536	905635	32099
Group - D	521578	389338	-132240

Total	1410646	1409235	
-------	---------	---------	--